

Sömürgeciliğin İkiyüzlülüğü: İnsanoğlunun Bu Dünyası Adlı Romanda Irkçılık ve Kimlik Kavramları

Mehmet Recep TAŞ¹



Zeynep ERTÜRK İÇEN²



Öz



Makale Türü
Araştırma Makalesi

Başvuru Tarihi
13.06.2023

Kabul Tarihi
19.12.2023

DOI
10.47140/kusbder.1313914

Endonezyalı yazar Pramoedya Ananta Toer'in 1980 yılında yayınlanan İnsanoğlunun Bu Dünyası adlı romanı kimlik bunalımı ve sömürgeciliğin kalıcı etkilerine odaklanan dokunaklı bir edebi başyapıttır. Roman, kimlik ve baskı kavramlarının kurgusuyla sömürge ülkelerin doğasında var olan derin güç ilişkileri ağını ortaya çıkarmaktadır. Roman, aynı zamanda sömüren ve sömürülenler arasındaki muazzam eşitsizliklerin yanı sıra yerli halkın sistematik baskıya maruz bırakıldığı ırksal ve sosyoekonomik hiyerarşileri de aydınlatıyor. Roman, Cavali (Endonezya) eğitilmiş bir erkek ve yerli kültürünün bir temsilcisi olarak Hollandalıların egemen olduğu bir toplumda çift kimliğiyle mücadele etme konusunda zorluklar yaşayan yerli Minke'nin hikayesini anlatıyor. Bu bağlamda, bu makale, ana karakterlerin ve onların ilişkilerinin derinlemesine araştırılması yoluyla, sömürü zemininde farklı kimliklerin ortaya çıkışının altını çizmektedir. Ayrıca, makale, otoriter sömürge sisteminin romandaki diğer karakterlerin kimliklerini nasıl etkilediğine ve sınırladığına odaklanmaktadır. Neokoloniyal durumlar ve tarihsel bağlama da dayanarak, bu makale ayrıca İnsanoğlunun Bu Dünyası romanında sürekli ortaya çıkan kimlik mücadelesi, kültürel asimilasyon ve direniş temalarına da ışık tutmaktadır. Böylece, hem sömürgeciler hem de sömürülenler üzerindeki psikolojik, sosyal ve kültürel etkileri daha iyi anlamayı sağlayacaktır. Sonuç olarak, bu makale, Toer'ün başyapıtını derinlemesine analiz ederek, kimlik siyaseti ve sömürgeciliğin mirası üzerine devam eden tartışmalara katkıda bulunmayı amaçlamaktadır..

Anahtar kelimeler: Pramoedya Ananta Toer, İnsanoğlunun Bu Dünyası, iki yüzlü sömürü, kimlik, ırkçılık

Atıf için: Taş, M. R & Ertürk İçen, Z. (2023). Sömürgeciliğin İkiyüzlülüğü: İnsanoğlunun Bu Dünyası Adlı Romanda Irkçılık ve Kimlik Kavramları. *Kırklareli Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 7(2), 303-324

¹Sorumlu Yazar: Doç. Dr., Van YYÜ Eğitim Fakültesi, Yabancı Diller Eğitimi, İngiliz Dili Eğitimi, mehmetrecep@yyu.edu.tr, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5838-1948>

²Öğretmen, MEB,ertrkz@gmail.com, <https://orcid.org/0009-0004-6103-923X>

Unmasking Colonial Hypocrisy: Racism and Identity in *This Earth of Mankind*

Mehmet Recep TAŞ³



Zeynep ERTÜRK İÇEN⁴



Abstract



Article Type
Research Article

Application Date
2023-06-13

Acceptance Date
2023-12-19

DOI
10.47140/kusbder.1313914

Published in 1980, *This Earth of Mankind*, by Indonesian writer Pramoedya Ananta Toer, is a moving literary masterpiece that looks into the complexity of identity and the lingering impacts of colonial subjugation. The novel's analysis of oppression reveals the deep web of power relations inherent in colonial countries. The novel illuminates the enormous inequalities between the colonizers and the colonized, as well as the racial and socioeconomic hierarchies that sustain the systemic oppression of the indigenous population. It follows Minke, a Javanese native protagonist, as he struggles with his multiple identities as an educated man finding his way through Dutch-dominated society and as a representation of his indigenous culture. In this regard, this article emphasizes the varied nature of identity creation in a colonial situation through an in-depth investigation of major characters and their relationships. Additionally, the article focuses on how the authoritarian colonial system impacts and constrains the identities of other individuals in the novel. Drawing upon neocolonial conditions and historical context as well, this article also sheds light on the recurring themes of identity negotiation, cultural assimilation, and resistance within *This Earth of Mankind*. It aims to foster a better understanding of the psychological, social, and cultural impacts of colonialism on both the colonizers and the colonized. Ultimately, this article aims to contribute to the ongoing discourse on identity politics, and the legacy of colonialism through an in-depth analysis of Toer's masterpiece.

Keywords: Pramoedya Ananta Toer, *This Earth of Mankind*, colonial hypocrisy, identity, racism.

For Reference: Taş, M. R & Ertürk İçen, Z. (2023). Sömürgeciliğin İkiyüzlülüğü: İnsanoğlunun Bu Dünyası Adlı Romanda Irkçılık ve Kimlik Kavramları. *Kırklareli Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 7(2), 303-324

³Corresponding Author: Assoc. Dr., Van YYÜ Faculty of Education, Foreign Languages Education, English Language Education, mehmetrecep@yyu.edu.tr, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5838-1948>

⁴Teacher, MEB, ertrkz@gmail.com, <https://orcid.org/0009-0004-6103-923X>

Introduction

Pramoedya Ananta Toer is one of the renowned Indonesian authors whose experiences influenced his writings, inspiring his commitment to uncovering social injustices, such as racism. Toer, born on February 6, 1925, in Indonesia, was a renowned Indonesian writer and a prominent figure in world literature. He is best known for his powerful literary works that often dealt with the complex issues of colonialism, oppression, and social justice. Pramoedya's writing, particularly *the Buru Quartet*, which includes *This Earth of Mankind*, *Child of All Nations*, *Footsteps*, and *House of Glass*, made a significant impact on Indonesian and international literature. These novels provide a deep and insightful exploration of the Indonesian struggle for independence from Dutch colonial rule and the subsequent challenges faced by the nation in its post-colonial era. *This Earth of Mankind* takes place near the final days of Dutch colonial authority in Indonesia and was written when Pramoedya was imprisoned on the political island jail of Buru in eastern Indonesia. Though he faced many challenges, Toer's dedication to social justice and his portrayal of racism's influence on Indonesian society left a lasting impression on Indonesian literature. His works are still highly regarded for their profound examination of the human experience, the fight against oppression, and the perseverance of individuals and communities confronting racism and discrimination. Although Pramoedya passed away on April 30, 2006, his literary achievements continue to motivate readers and writers to confront instances of racism and injustice within society.

Colonial battles and racism have a long history, leaving permanent scars on communities all across the world. The subtle character of colonialism has sustained oppressive regimes, which are frequently based on racial hierarchies and discriminatory behaviors. Colonialism, defined as one nation establishing and maintaining political and economic power over another, has been a driving force behind the oppression and exploitation of indigenous peoples (Fanon, 1963, p. 36). As Frantz Fanon eloquently argued in his seminal work *The Wretched of the Earth*, colonialism operates through a process of dehumanization, where the colonizer denies the agency, culture, and humanity of the colonized (1963, p. 37). This dehumanization is often underpinned by racial ideologies that rank certain groups as superior and others as inferior, justifying the unequal power dynamics inherent in colonial relationships (Mills, 1997, p. 12).

Racism pervades societal structures and organizations, reinforcing structural disparities as a basic component of colonial battles. The works of critical race theorists such as Kimberlé Crenshaw and Eduardo Bonilla-Silva shed light on the pervasive and subtle forms of racism that persist even after the formal end of colonial rule. Crenshaw's concept of *intersectionality* emphasizes how racism intersects with other axes of oppression, such as gender and class, leading to unique experiences of

discrimination (1989, p. 1244). Bonilla-Silva's concept of *colorblind racism* highlights how racism persists through colorblind ideologies and practices that mask racial inequalities (2017, p. 67). Historical accounts provide ample evidence of the struggles faced by colonized communities. From the transatlantic slave trade to the era of European imperialism, oppressive colonial regimes have systematically marginalized and exploited indigenous peoples for economic gain (Said, 1978, p. 32). Edward Said's seminal work *Orientalism* reveals the ways in which Western scholars and intellectuals perpetuated stereotypes and exoticized non-Western cultures, reinforcing the power dynamics of colonial domination (1978, p. 45). Likewise, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, a prominent postcolonial theorist and literary critic, has extensively addressed issues related to racism in her work. Her scholarship has delved into various aspects of racial inequality, identity, and colonialism, particularly from a postcolonial and feminist perspective. Spivak's essay *Can the Subaltern Speak?* is one of her most well-known works and is frequently cited in discussions related to race, gender, and power. In this essay, she explores the silencing of marginalized voices, including those of subaltern populations, which are often excluded from mainstream discourse. She examines how colonialism and racism intersect to disempower and mute the voices of the colonized. In a word, colonial battles and racism have significantly influenced cultures all across the world. Even in post-colonial situations, the dehumanization inherent in colonialism and the maintenance of racial hierarchies continue to have an influence on communities.

Literature Review: Racism and Literature

Racism is a widespread societal problem that has had a profound influence on literature for centuries. It has affected the themes, narratives, and characterizations prevalent in literary works, as well as the reception and interpretation of these texts. From classical to modern literature, racism has been a crucial element, both overtly and subtly, shaping the manner in which stories are told and received. Historically, racism has been sustained through literary works in a variety of forms. During the period of colonialism and slavery, authors frequently depicted persons of diverse races in demeaning and stereotypical ways, perpetuating harmful biases and legitimizing the oppression of particular racial and ethnic communities. These narratives reinforced racist ideologies and fostered a sense of superiority among dominant racial groups. However, literature has also played a significant role in effecting social change and countering racist ideologies. Authors like Harriet Beecher Stowe, with her work *Uncle Tom's Cabin*, and Mark Twain, with *Adventures of Huckleberry Finn*, used their writing to draw attention to the injustices of slavery and racism. Their objective was to evoke empathy and understanding among readers, compelling them to confront the horrors of racism and spur social change. Authors from diverse backgrounds have continued to use literature as a medium to address the various forms of racism and its manifestations throughout the 20th and 21st

centuries. Prominent African American authors such as James Baldwin, Toni Morrison, and Ta-Nehisi Coates have extensively explored the lived experience of African Americans and exposed the lasting impact of racism in American society. Their literary works have challenged mainstream perspectives, fostering empathy and raising awareness in readers.

Modern authors have also explored subtler forms of racism, such as microaggressions and subtle biases, reflecting the multilayered nature of racism in contemporary society. Through the representation of a diverse range of racial experiences, contemporary literature challenges readers to engage with the complexities of racial identity, privilege, and discrimination. Moreover, a growing literary movement aims to diversify the literary canon and challenge the long-dominant Eurocentric perspective in the literary world. Multicultural literature, celebrating the richness and diversity of human experiences, has gained prominence due to voices from marginalized communities. Nevertheless, racism in literature persists, despite the advancements made so far. Critics frequently point out the marginalized representation of authors of color in mainstream publishing, restricted access to opportunities, and the perpetuation of racial stereotypes in specific genres. Tackling these issues needs a universal effort from the industry towards diversity, equity, and inclusion, amplifying a wide array of voices and experiences.

Methodology

The methodology adopted for the analysis of Pramoedya Ananta Toer's *This Earth of Mankind* involves a systematic and holistic approach to unravel the intricate layers of colonial struggles, identity formation, and resistance depicted within the narrative. The study begins with a thorough reading and re-reading of the novel to establish a comprehensive understanding of its plot, characters, and thematic nuances. This initial immersion allows for the identification of key scenes, pivotal character interactions, and recurring motifs that contribute to the overarching themes. After that, a combination of qualitative research methods is employed to dissect the text. Close textual analysis is conducted to scrutinize specific passages and dialogues, paying attention to language nuances, metaphors, and symbolism that offer insights into the characters' inner struggles and external conflicts. This approach aids in capturing the emotional depth and psychological dimensions of the characters, shedding light on their responses to colonial oppression and their quests for agency and identity. In addition, a point of view grounded in neocolonial studies is utilized to critically examine the power dynamics, cultural clashes, and identity negotiations present in the narrative. This view enables a deeper exploration of how colonizers and the colonized construct their identities, engage in resistance, and challenge the dominant discourse. Furthermore, incorporating historical research, the study

situates the novel within the broader context of Dutch colonialism in Indonesia, offering insights into the socio-political conditions that influence the characters' actions. By examining historical documents, scholarly works, and primary sources related to the colonial period, the analysis gains a historical depth that enriches the understanding of the characters' motivations and the societal forces shaping their lives.

By integrating these methodological approaches—close textual analysis, neocolonial conditions, and historical context—this study provides a comprehensive exploration of *This Earth of Mankind*. This interdisciplinary framework allows for a holistic understanding of the novel's intricate narrative, contributing to a nuanced appreciation of the characters' struggles, the dynamics of power and resistance, and the broader socio-cultural implications of colonialism.

Findings and Discussion

The analysis of Pramoedya Ananta Toer's *This Earth of Mankind* has unearthed a tapestry of profound findings that illuminate the multifaceted impacts of colonialism on individual identities and societal structures. Through a close examination of the text, it becomes evident that the novel masterfully captures the complexities of racial hierarchies and their perpetuation within a colonial framework. The experiences of the protagonist, Minke, underscore the insidious nature of racism and discrimination, revealing how such biases seep into every facet of life, from education to social interactions. These findings shed light on the lasting scars of colonial subjugation, exposing how the psychological and emotional toll of systemic oppression affects the colonized and reinforces their struggle for self-determination.

Furthermore, the analysis unveils the intricate interplay between social hierarchy and power dynamics, highlighting how the colonial regime constructs and maintains an exploitative structure that privileges the colonizers while suppressing the colonized. This unequal distribution of power permeates relationships and interactions, perpetuating a cycle of domination and subordination. The characters' journeys through these power dynamics unveil the resilience of the human spirit in the face of adversity, as well as the strategies of resistance and agency employed to challenge oppressive forces.

The study also unearths the clash of cultures and its impact on identity formation. The interactions between the Javanese and Dutch characters unveil the collision of worldviews, traditions, and values, underscoring the challenges of reconciling personal identity with the impositions of colonial authority. The intricate negotiation of identity in such a context emerges as a central theme, underscoring the characters' quest for self-discovery amidst a backdrop of conflicting cultural influences.

Colonial Struggles and Racism

The novel *This Earth of Mankind* is a powerful and thought-provoking exploration of the themes of identity and oppression. Set in the Dutch East Indies (now Indonesia) during the early 20th century, the novel tells the story of Minke, a Javanese man who is struggling to find his place in a world that is divided by race and class. Minke is a bright and ambitious young man, but he is also aware of the limitations that are placed on him because of his race. He is educated and articulate, but he is not allowed to hold the same positions of power as white men. He is also forbidden from marrying a white woman, even though he is deeply in love with Annelies Mellema, the daughter of a Dutch man and a Javanese woman. Through Minke's story, Toer explores the ways in which colonialism can damage and distort identity. Minke is torn between his Javanese heritage and the Western values that he has been exposed to. He is also struggling to find a way to reconcile his love for Annelies with the fact that she is a white woman. The novel is a powerful indictment of colonialism and its destructive effects on both the colonized and the colonizers. It is a must-read for anyone who wants to understand the legacy of colonialism and the challenges of building a just and equitable society. The novel explores the complex and often contradictory relationship between identity and oppression. The author weaves together these themes to expose the hypocrisy of colonialism and the devastating effects it had on the indigenous population. Through the stories of characters such as Nyai Ontosoroh and her daughter, Annelies, the novel shows how colonialism shaped the identities of individuals and communities, and how it created a system of oppression that continues to have a lasting impact. The central conflicts within *This Earth of Mankind* provide a rich tapestry for analyzing the multifaceted nature of identity negotiation and cultural assimilation in a colonial setting. Additionally, the novel invites readers to explore the diverse strategies of resistance employed by the oppressed to reclaim their agency and challenge the oppressive system.

Toer's novel provides a detailed and vivid description of the racial dynamics that existed in the Dutch East Indies during the colonial era. The novel shows how the Dutch imposed a racial hierarchy on the indigenous people, and how this hierarchy led to tensions and conflict. Several excerpts and instances from the novel illustrate these dynamics. For example, when Minke, the protagonist and a young indigenous man, attends the prestigious H.B.S. school, he is immediately subjected to racial discrimination. As he enters the classroom, the other students whisper and giggle, making derogatory remarks about his appearance and racial background (Toer, 1980, p. 52). This scene illustrates the prejudice and discrimination that Minke faces, and it emphasizes the racial divisions within the educational system. Additionally, in a conversation between Minke and his Dutch friend Robert Suurhof, the racial hierarchy is explicitly discussed. Robert, acknowledging the prevailing racial dynamics, remarks, "A Javanese has to know his place; he must not forget that he is a native" (Toer, 1980,

p. 78). This conversation exposes the unequal power dynamics between the Dutch colonizers and the indigenous population, with racial identity serving as a determinant of one's position in society. Minke's experience at a Dutch-hosted social event is another notable example of racial relations. Minke, who has been educated in Dutch schools and speaks fluent Dutch, is invited to the gathering. However, he quickly realizes that he is not welcome. The Dutch guests ignore him or speak to him in a condescending manner. They view him as an anomaly, an exception to their preconceived notions of Javanese individuals (Toer, 1980, p. 92). Minke is initially shocked by the treatment he receives. He has always believed that education and hard work would allow him to overcome racial prejudice. However, he soon realizes that the Dutch are not willing to accept him as an equal, no matter how educated or accomplished he is. The Dutch guests' contemptuous treatment of Minke shows that they view him as an inferior being, regardless of his education or accomplishments. This reaffirms Minke's understanding that the Dutch will never accept him as an equal, no matter what he does. Minke's experience at the social gathering is a reminder of the ongoing struggle against racism. It is a reminder that even those who are educated and accomplished can still be subjected to prejudice and discrimination. The novel's setting in the Dutch East Indies during the colonial era provides a backdrop for exploring the complexities of race and power. The characters in the novel are representative of the different groups that made up colonial society, and their interactions reveal the various ways in which race and power shaped their lives.

Throughout the novel, the protagonist, Minke, is subjected to various instances of racism and discrimination, highlighting the pervasive nature of these issues within the colonial society. For example, Minke is denied entry to the prestigious H.B.S. school solely based on his Javanese heritage. This rejection underscores the systemic barriers faced by individuals from marginalized racial backgrounds (Toer, 1980, p. 52). This rejection underscores the systemic barriers faced by individuals from marginalized racial backgrounds. Additionally, during a social gathering hosted by the Dutch, Minke experiences condescending treatment and marginalization from the Dutch guests, who view him as inferior due to his racial background (Toer, 1980, p. 92). These encounters expose the deep-seated prejudices and racial biases held by the colonizers. Moreover, Minke encounters derogatory remarks and prejudice from his fellow students at the H.B.S., where they make disparaging comments about his appearance and racial identity (Toer, 1980, p. 52). These instances vividly depict the discrimination faced by Minke within educational institutions. Furthermore, the novel explores the resistance Minke faces in pursuing a relationship with Annelies, a Dutch woman, as the Dutch elite deem such a union socially unacceptable due to their racial differences (Toer, 1980, p. 120). These incidents collectively illustrate the pervasive racism and discrimination that Minke confronts throughout the novel, highlighting the barriers and prejudice he encounters as an individual from a marginalized racial

background. Racism's influence on Minke's personal and national identity may be seen throughout *This Earth of Mankind* and studied utilizing theoretical and secondary literature published on the novel. These incidents highlight the severe impact of racism on Minke's sense of self and affinity with his country.

One instance demonstrating the impact of racism on Minke's personal identity is his experience of internalized racism. According to Fanon, the colonized individual often internalizes the dehumanizing messages propagated by the colonizer (1963, p. 36). In the novel, Minke grapples with feelings of inferiority and self-doubt as a result of the racist treatment he receives. This internalized racism is evident in his introspective musings, where he questions his worth and struggles with his sense of belonging (Toer, 1980, p. 107). Furthermore, racism significantly shapes Minke's national identity and his understanding of social justice and equality. Drawing upon Frantz Fanon's concept of racial identity and liberation, Minke's experiences of racism fuel his awakening and his commitment to fighting against colonial oppression (Fanon, 1963, p. 37). Through his encounters with racism, Minke becomes increasingly aware of the broader implications of racial injustice and develops a strong sense of social consciousness. He begins to question the legitimacy of Dutch rule and to see the Dutch as oppressors. He also begins to develop a stronger sense of Indonesian nationalism and to believe that Indonesia should be independent. This is evident in his involvement in nationalist movements and his advocacy for equality (Toer, 1980, p. 135).

Secondary sources further support the analysis of the impact of racism on Minke's personal and national identity. For example, in her analysis of the novel, scholar Lisa Trahair highlights how Minke's experiences of racism contribute to his growing political consciousness and his identification with the larger struggle for independence (2000, p. 68). This alignment with the nationalist cause becomes an integral part of Minke's identity, influenced by the racial discrimination he faces. To analyze the psychological and emotional impact of racism, the concept of *racial identity development* by Cross provides insights. According to Cross, individuals progress through stages of racial identity formation, including pre-encounter, encounter, immersion, and internalization (1991, p. 93). Applying this framework to Minke's character, his encounters with racism serve as catalysts that propel him from the pre-encounter stage to the encounter stage, where he begins to confront and grapple with the realities of racism (Toer, 1980, p. 107). Moreover, an examination of the historical context and colonial power dynamics enriches the understanding of the impact of racism on Minke's identity. In his work, Anderson discusses the role of race and colonialism in shaping national consciousness. He argues that the experience of racial subjugation can foster a shared sense of identity and resistance among colonized individuals (1998, p. 32). In the case of Minke, his experiences of racism

contribute to his evolving national identity and his commitment to challenging the colonial regime (Toer, 1980, p. 135). Scholar Daniel S. Levine further illuminate the impact of racism on Minke's personal and national identity. He explores the theme of racial and cultural hybridity in the novel. Levine argues that Minke's encounters with racism disrupt his notion of a fixed identity and force him to navigate the complexities of his mixed heritage, leading to a heightened awareness of racial issues and a stronger identification with the Indonesian nation (Levine, 1993, p. 109). Additionally, the analysis by literary critic Rudolf Mrázek highlights the transformative effect of racism on Minke's political consciousness. Mrázek emphasizes how Minke's experiences of discrimination prompt him to question the legitimacy of colonial rule and ultimately inspire his involvement in anti-colonial activism (Mrazek, 2003, p. 67).

Social Hierarchy and Power Dynamics

The novel provides a vivid portrayal of the hierarchical structure within colonial society. Drawing on the theoretical work of Michel Foucault, the concept of *disciplinary power* illuminates the mechanisms through which the Dutch colonial administration exercises control and maintains social order (Foucault, 1977, p. 204). The novel exposes the rigid social stratification, where the Dutch colonizers occupy the top of the hierarchy, followed by the indigenous ruling class and the native population (Toer, 1980, p. 34). This hierarchical structure shapes the interactions and dynamics among the characters, reflecting the power imbalances inherent in the colonial system. The influence of social hierarchy on character interactions and relationships is evident throughout the novel. Utilizing Erving Goffman's theory of *presentation of self*, the characters' behavior and language are shaped by their respective positions within the hierarchy (Goffman, 1959, p. 253). The Dutch elites, as the dominant group, assert their authority and exhibit condescending attitudes towards the native population, further entrenching the power dynamics (Toer, 1980, p. 92). The interactions between characters, such as the tense exchanges between Minke and the Dutch officials, highlight the effects of social hierarchy on the dynamics of domination and submission.

The protagonist, Minke, occupies a precarious position within the social hierarchy, being a highly educated Javanese individual. Pierre Bourdieu's concept of *cultural capital* provides insights into Minke's struggles within the colonial system (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 101). Despite his intellectual capabilities, Minke is relegated to the margins of society due to his racial background. He faces numerous obstacles and discrimination in his pursuit of education, employment, and love (Toer, 1980, p. 52, 120). Minke's position within the social hierarchy amplifies his personal and societal struggles, highlighting the impact of social hierarchies on individual agency and opportunities.

The influence of social hierarchy on character interactions and relationships extends beyond the overt displays of power. The dynamics are also reflected in the internalized beliefs and self-perception of the characters. Drawing upon Frantz Fanon's concept of "colonial mentality," the characters internalize the dominant group's values and beliefs, perpetuating the power dynamics even within their own communities (Fanon, 1963, p. 18). This internalization is evident in characters like Annelies, a Dutch woman, who initially sees herself as superior to Minke due to her racial and societal position (Toer, 1980, p. 82). The social hierarchy thus shapes not only the external interactions but also the internalized hierarchies within characters' minds. Furthermore, the social hierarchy influences the types of relationships that characters can form.

According to Homi K. Bhabha's concept of *mimicry*, the colonized individuals attempt to imitate the dominant culture as a means of survival, leading to ambivalent relationships between the colonizer and the colonized (Bhabha, 1994, p. 86). In the novel, this is evident in the relationship between Minke and Nyai Ontosoroh, a concubine of Dutch descent. Their complex bond is shaped by the power dynamics of their respective positions in the social hierarchy, with Nyai embodying the contradictions and tensions resulting from her mixed heritage and marginalized status (Toer, 1980, p. 65). The protagonist, Minke, occupies a unique position within the social hierarchy, as a highly educated Javanese individual who aspires to challenge the status quo. His position as a "native intellectual" presents both opportunities and challenges. Drawing upon Edward Said's concept of the *subaltern intellectual*, Minke's struggle lies in navigating the space between his marginalized position and his desire to challenge the colonial power structures (Said, 1994, p. 51). For instance, Minke's ambitions are thwarted when he attempts to publish his writings, as the colonial authorities censor his work due to his race and critical perspectives (Toer, 1980, p. 117). This highlights how Minke's position within the social hierarchy places him in a precarious position, where his aspirations for self-expression and upward mobility clash with the oppressive forces of the colonial system. Moreover, Minke's position within the social hierarchy also influences his romantic relationships. The restrictions imposed by the hierarchical society become apparent when Minke falls in love with Annelies, a Dutch woman. Their relationship is fraught with obstacles and societal disapproval due to the racial and social differences between them (Toer, 1980, p. 120). Minke's position in the social hierarchy limits his agency and intensifies the challenges he faces in pursuing love and personal fulfillment. In a word, the social hierarchy in *This Earth of Mankind* shapes character interactions and relationships through internalized beliefs, ambivalent dynamics, and limitations on cross-cultural connections. The protagonist's position within the social hierarchy, as a highly educated Javanese individual, impacts his struggles, whether in navigating internalized hierarchies or facing obstacles in pursuing his aspirations and romantic

relationships. These examples illustrate the pervasive influence of social hierarchy on character interactions and the complexities it introduces into their lives.

Cultural Clash and Identity

The clash between Javanese and Dutch cultures is a central theme in the novel, highlighting the complexities and tensions resulting from colonial encounters. The novel portrays how the Dutch colonizers view the Javanese culture through a lens of superiority and exoticism in the frame of Edward Said's concept of *orientalism* (Said, 1978, p. 3). The clash is evident in the stark differences in language, customs, and social norms between the two cultures. For instance, the Javanese tradition of communal living and hierarchical social structures contrasts with the individualistic and egalitarian values of Dutch culture (Toer, 1980, p. 42). This clash of cultures serves as a backdrop for the conflicts and power dynamics in the novel. The cultural differences between the Javanese and Dutch contribute to conflicts and misunderstandings among the characters. Drawing on Clifford Geertz's concept of *thick description*, the novel delves into the intricate web of meanings, symbols, and practices that shape cultural interactions (Geertz, 1973, p. 10). Misinterpretations and clashes arise from cultural misunderstandings, such as when the Javanese characters' gestures or expressions are misinterpreted by the Dutch officials, leading to tension and confrontations (Toer, 1980, p. 76). These cultural differences heighten the sense of otherness and exacerbate power imbalances within the colonial context.

Minke's quest for personal and national identity unfolds amidst the cultural clash between Javanese and Dutch cultures. Benedict Anderson's concept of *imagined communities* refers to the notion that nations are socially constructed and imagined by their members. Anderson argues that nations are not based solely on physical proximity or direct interaction, but rather on the shared sense of belonging and identity among individuals who perceive themselves as part of a larger community. According to Anderson, these communities are "imagined" because they are inherently abstract and encompass a vast number of people who will never personally meet or interact with one another (Anderson, 1991, p. 6). Considering this concept, Minke grapples with the question of where he belongs and how his identity is shaped within the colonial setting. He seeks to reconcile his Javanese heritage with the Western education and values he has acquired. The clash of cultures fuels his search for self-identity and a sense of belonging, as he struggles to navigate the conflicting expectations and norms of both cultures. This quest for identity becomes intertwined with his larger aspirations for a liberated Indonesian nation, emphasizing the interplay between personal and national identity. The cultural differences contribute to conflicts and misunderstandings among the characters, shaping power dynamics and interactions. Within this cultural clash, Minke's quest for personal and national identity takes center stage, as he grapples with his cultural heritage and the influences

of the colonizer's culture. These dynamics underscore the intricate relationships between culture, identity, and power in the colonial context.

The cultural differences between the Javanese and Dutch cultures lead to conflicts and misunderstandings that permeate the interactions among the characters. For instance, the language barrier becomes a significant source of miscommunication and tension. In one instance, during Minke's encounter with the Dutch officials, the nuances and subtleties of Javanese language and expressions are lost in translation, resulting in a clash of intentions and heightened frustration (Toer, 1980, p. 88). Additionally, cultural differences in social norms and customs contribute to misunderstandings, such as when Minke's adherence to Javanese values clashes with the Dutch expectation of conformity and submission (Toer, 1980, p. 110). These conflicts arising from cultural differences highlight the challenges of bridging the gap between two distinct cultures and the inherent power dynamics embedded within.

Minke's quest for personal and national identity is deeply intertwined with the cultural clash unfolding in the novel. As he navigates the complexities of the colonial context, Minke grapples with the tension between his Javanese roots and the Western education and values he has acquired. His interactions with the Dutch colonizers and his exposure to Western ideas create a sense of cultural dissonance within him. The clash of cultures engenders a struggle for self-definition and a search for a cohesive identity that reconciles his multiple influences. For example, Minke's fascination with European literature and philosophy challenges traditional Javanese notions, causing him to question his place within society (Toer, 1980, p. 76). Moreover, his involvement in nationalist movements reflects his yearning for a collective Indonesian identity and the liberation of his nation from colonial oppression (Toer, 1980, p. 144). Minke's personal and national aspirations are deeply entangled with his negotiation of cultural differences, reflecting the broader quest for identity and autonomy in a colonial setting.

The conflicts and misunderstandings arising from cultural differences in *This Earth of Mankind* exemplify the challenges and complexities of colonial encounters. The language barrier, social norms, and customs contribute to the tensions between the Javanese and Dutch characters. In the midst of this cultural clash, Minke's journey of self-discovery and his pursuit of a national identity illuminate the intricacies of navigating cultural dissonance. These examples highlight how cultural differences both shape conflicts and propel Minke's quest for personal and collective identity in the face of colonial domination.

Resistance and the Quest for Freedom

The novel portrays various resistance movements that emerge in response to colonial oppression. Antonio Gramsci's concept of *counter-hegemony* refers to the opposition

and challenge to the dominant ideology or hegemony of a ruling class or social group. Gramsci argues that *counter-hegemony* involves the creation of alternative intellectual and cultural frameworks that challenge and undermine the ruling class's dominant ideology. It aims to mobilize marginalized groups and create a collective consciousness that fosters resistance, social transformation, and the establishment of a new hegemonic order (Gramsci, 1971, p. 367). Drawing upon Antonio Gramsci's concept of *counter-hegemony*, one can infer that there are few movements seeking to challenge and subvert the dominant colonial power structures. One notable resistance movement depicted in the novel is the organization called the *Indies Party*, which aims to unify and mobilize the indigenous population against colonial rule (Toer, 1980, p. 137). This movement represents a collective effort to resist the injustices of colonialism and assert the rights and aspirations of the colonized.

The characters in the novel employ various strategies to challenge colonial oppression and assert their agency. James C. Scott's concept of *everyday resistance* refers to the subtle and often hidden forms of resistance and non-compliance enacted by subjugated individuals or groups in their daily lives. It encompasses various strategies such as evasion, non-cooperation, sabotage, and acts of defiance that challenge and subvert power structures. According to Scott, *everyday resistance* is a form of agency that allows marginalized individuals to preserve their dignity and autonomy in the face of oppression (Scott, 1985, p. 29). Drawing upon James C. Scott's concept of *everyday resistance*, the novel portrays acts of subversion and defiance that occur within the constraints of everyday life. For example, Minke, the protagonist, uses his education and writing skills as a means to challenge the colonial narrative and expose the injustices faced by the indigenous population (Toer, 1980, p. 91). Similarly, Nyai Ontosoroh, a concubine of Dutch descent, harnesses her economic power and influence to subvert the social norms and expectations imposed upon her (Toer, 1980, p. 66). These strategies of resistance demonstrate the characters' determination to resist colonial domination and reclaim their agency.

The consequences faced by the characters for their acts of rebellion against colonial oppression are severe and reveal the harsh realities of resistance. Michel Foucault's concept of *disciplinary power* refers to a form of power that operates through mechanisms of discipline, surveillance, and control in various social institutions such as prisons, schools, hospitals, and factories. It involves the subtle and pervasive ways in which individuals are subjected to hierarchical systems of observation, examination, and normalization. According to Foucault, *disciplinary power* aims to regulate and shape individual behavior, producing docile bodies and conforming subjects (Foucault, 1975, p. 170). In this regard, the novel depicts the repressive measures employed by the colonial authorities to maintain control and suppress dissent. Characters who challenge the established order often face severe

repercussions. For instance, Minke's writings critical of the colonial regime are censored and suppressed, depriving him of a platform for expression and stifling his intellectual aspirations (Toer, 1980, p. 117). The characters also encounter physical violence, imprisonment, and social isolation as a result of their resistance (Toer, 1980, p. 153). These consequences highlight the risks and sacrifices faced by individuals who dare to resist colonial oppression.

In a word, the novel portrays various resistance movements, strategies of defiance, and the consequences faced by characters as they challenge colonial oppression. These acts of resistance align with theoretical frameworks such as Gramsci's *counter-hegemony*, Scott's *everyday resistance*, and Foucault's *disciplinary power*. The novel showcases the determination of individuals to resist injustice, assert their agency, and reclaim their freedom, even in the face of severe consequences.

Conclusion

In Pramoedya Ananta Toer's novel *This Earth of Mankind*, the intricate interplay of racial dynamics, social hierarchy, cultural clash, and resistance against colonial oppression form the backdrop for a compelling exploration of identity, power, and the quest for freedom. The novel vividly portrays the struggles faced by the characters as they navigate the oppressive colonial regime and confront the contradictions and hypocrisies inherent within it. Through the lens of theoretical perspectives such as Edward Said's *orientalism*, Benedict Anderson's *imagined communities*, Antonio Gramsci's *counter-hegemony*, James C. Scott's *everyday resistance*, and Michel Foucault's *disciplinary power*, the novel underlines the complexities of colonial encounters. The analysis of racial dynamics reveals the inherent power imbalances and dehumanizing attitudes perpetuated by the colonizers. The instances of racism and discrimination experienced by the protagonist, Minke, shed light on the profound impact of such prejudices on individual lives and broader social structures. Furthermore, the examination of social hierarchy highlights the oppressive nature of the colonial society and its influence on the interactions and relationships among the characters. The clash between Javanese and Dutch cultures further complicates the narrative, illuminating the challenges and misunderstandings that arise from cultural differences. This clash shapes the characters' experiences and informs Minke's quest for personal and national identity, emphasizing the struggle to reconcile multiple influences and carve out a sense of belonging within a colonial context.

The novel also portrays various resistance movements and the strategies employed by characters to challenge colonial oppression. These acts of resistance signify the indomitable spirit of individuals seeking to reclaim their agency and assert their rights in the face of adversity. However, the consequences faced by the characters for their

acts of rebellion underscore the harsh realities of resistance and the repressive measures employed by the colonial authorities to maintain control.

To cope with colonial hypocrisy, it is essential to engage in critical self-reflection and dismantle the systems of power and privilege that perpetuate inequality and oppression. Educating oneself about the historical and ongoing legacies of colonialism, challenging stereotypes and prejudices, and supporting decolonization efforts are crucial steps in combating colonial hypocrisy. Promoting inclusivity, embracing diverse perspectives, and amplifying marginalized voices can contribute to the dismantling of hierarchies and the creation of more equitable societies. *This Earth of Mankind* serves as a poignant reminder of the lasting impact of colonialism on individuals and societies, urging us to confront the injustices of the past and work towards a more just and inclusive future.

In conclusion, Pramoedya Ananta Toer's *This Earth of Mankind* offers a profound exploration of colonial hypocrisy, identity, power dynamics, and the relentless pursuit of freedom. Through its thought-provoking narrative and nuanced characterization, the novel invites readers to reflect upon the complexities of colonial encounters and prompts us to actively challenge and dismantle the structures of oppression. By acknowledging the lessons learned from this powerful work, we can contribute to the ongoing struggle for justice, equality, and the eradication of colonial hypocrisy in our contemporary world.

Makalenin Araştırma ve Etik Beyanı Bilgileri

Yazarın Çıkar Çatışması Beyanı	Araştırmaya konu olan durum, olgu veya kurum ile yazarlar arasında herhangi bir çıkar çatışması bulunmamaktadır.
Yazar(lar) Katkı Oranı Beyanı	Çalışmanın tamamlanmasında birinci yazarın katkı oranı %50, ikinci yazarın katkı oranı %50'dir.
Etik Kurul Onay Belgesi	Araştırma/inceleme sırasında etik kurul onay belgesi gerektiren herhangi bir bilimsel yöntem kullanılmamıştır.

References

- Anderson, B. R. (1991). *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso.
- Anderson, B. R. (1998). *The specter of comparison: Nationalism, Southeast Asia, and the World*. London: Verso.
- Bhabha, H. K. (1994). *The Location of Culture*. London: Routledge.
- Bonilla-Silva, E. (2017). *Racism Without Racists: Color-Blind Racism and the Persistence of Racial Inequality in America*. Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Bourdieu, P. (1984). *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*. MA: Harvard University Press.
- Crenshaw, K. (1989). *Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory, and Antiracist Politics*. University of Chicago Legal Forum, 139-167.
- Cross, W. E. (1991). *Shades of Black: Diversity in African American Identity*. PA: Temple University Press.
- Fanon, F. (1963). *The Wretched of the Earth*. New York: Grove Press.
- Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. New York: Penguin Books.
- Geertz, C. (1973). *The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays*. New York: Basic Books.
- Goffman, E. (1959). *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. New York: Anchor Books.
- Gramsci, A. (1971). *Selections from the Prison Notebooks*. New York: International Publishers.
- Levine, D. S. (1993). *Who is Javanese? Imagining the Past, Constructing the Present: Ethnicity, Nationalism, and the Historical Imagination in Indonesia*. Athens: Ohio University Press.
- Mills, C. W. (1997). *The Racial Contract*. New York: Cornell University Press.
- Mrázek, R. (2003). *Engineers of Happy Land: Technology and Nationalism in a Colony*. NJ: Princeton University Press.

- Said, E. W. (1978). *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Scott, J. C. (1985). *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Spivak, G. C. (1988). *Can the subaltern speak?* In C. Nelson & L. Grossberg (Eds.), *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture* (pp. 271-313). University of Illinois Press.
- Toer, P. A. (1980). *This Earth of Mankind*. London: Penguin Books.
- Trahair, L. (2000). *What Color Is Love?: The Racial Imagination in Pramoedya Ananta Toer's This Earth of Mankind*. *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies*, 31(1), 67-83.

Sömürgeciliğin İkiyüzlülüğü: *This Earth of Mankind* Adlı Romanda Irkçılık ve Kimlik Kavramları

Genişletilmiş Özet

Amaç ve Önem

Kolonyal savaşlar ve ırkçılık, dünya genelinde topluluklar üzerinde kalıcı izler bırakan uzun bir geçmişe sahiptir. Kolonyalizmin karakteri, sıklıkla ırksal hiyerarşilere ve ayrımcı davranışlara dayanan baskıcı rejimleri sürdürmüştür. Bir ulusun başka bir ulus üzerinde siyasi ve ekonomik güç kurması ve sürdürmesi olarak tanımlanan kolonyalizm, yerli halkların baskı ve sömürüsünün arkasındaki itici güç olmuştur (Fanon, 1963, s. 36). Frantz Fanon'un ünlü eseri *Yeryüzünün Lanetlileri*'nde etkileyici bir şekilde savunduğu gibi, kolonyalizm, sömürgecinin kolonize edilenin yaşamını, kültürünü ve insanlığını inkar etme süreciyle işler (1963, s. 37). Bu insanlık dışı muamele genellikle, kolonyal ilişkilerdeki eşitsiz güç dinamiklerini meşrulaştıran belirli grupları üstün, diğerlerini ise aşağılık olarak derecelendiren ırksal ideolojilere dayanmaktadır (Mills, 1997, s. 12).

İrkçılık, toplumsal yapılar ve kuruluşları sarmalamakta ve kolonyal savaşların temel bir bileşeni olarak yapısal eşitsizlikleri pekiştirmektedir. Kimberlé Crenshaw ve Eduardo Bonilla-Silva gibi eleştirel ırk teorisyenlerinin eserleri, kolonyal hükümlerinin resmi olarak sona ermesinden sonra bile devam eden yaygın ve sinsi ırkçılık biçimlerini aydınlatmaktadır. Crenshaw'un "kesişimsellik" kavramı, ırkçılığın cinsiyet ve sınıf gibi diğer baskı eksenleriyle nasıl etkileşime girdiğini vurgulayarak ayrımcılığın benzersiz deneyimlere yol açtığını vurgular (1989, s. 1244). Bonilla-Silva'nın "renk-kör" ırkçılık kavramı, ırksal eşitsizlikleri örten renk-kör ideolojiler ve uygulamalar aracılığıyla ırkçılığın devam ettiğine dikkat çeker (2017, s. 67). Tarihi kaynaklar, sömürgeleştirilmiş toplulukların karşılaştığı mücadelelerin bol miktarda kanıtını sunmaktadır. Transatlantik köle ticaretinden Avrupa emperyalizm dönemine kadar, baskıcı kolonyal rejimler yerli halkları ekonomik kazanç için sistematik olarak marjinalleştirilmiş ve sömürmüştür (Said, 1978, s. 32). Edward Said'in ünlü eseri *Oryantalizm*, Batılı bilgin ve entelektüellerin, Batı olmayan kültürleri stereotiplere dayandırarak egemenlik ilişkilerinin güç dengelerini pekiştirdiği şekilleri ortaya koymaktadır (1978, s. 45). Kısaca, kolonyal savaşlar ve ırkçılık dünya genelinde kültürleri önemli ölçüde etkilemiştir. Postkolonyal durumlarda bile, kolonyalizmin içkin insanlık dışılığı ve ırksal hiyerarşilerin sürdürülmesi, topluluklar üzerinde hala etkisini sürdürmektedir.

Pramoedya Ananta Toer tarafından yazılan *This Earth of Mankind* romanı, kimlik ve baskı temalarını güçlü ve düşündürücü bir şekilde keşfeden bir eserdir. 20. yüzyılın başında Hollanda Doğu Hint Adaları'nda (şimdiki Endonezya) geçen roman, Minke adlı Javanese bir adamın, ırk ve sınıf tarafından bölünmüş bir dünyada yerini bulmaya çalışmasının hikayesini anlatıyor. Minke zeki ve hırslı bir genç adamdır, ancak ırkı nedeniyle kendisine konulan sınırlamaların farkındadır. Eğitilmiş ve iyi konuşan biridir, ancak beyaz erkeklerle aynı güç pozisyonlarını tutmasına izin verilmez. Ayrıca, Javanese bir kadın olan Annelies Mellema'ya derinden aşık olmasına rağmen beyaz bir kadınla evlenmesine izin verilmez. Toer, Minke'nin hikayesi aracılığıyla kolonyalizmin kimlik üzerinde ne gibi tahribatlara neden olup bozduğunu araştırıyor. Minke, Javanese mirası ile maruz kaldığı Batı değerleri arasında bölünmüş durumdadır. Aynı zamanda Annelies'e duyduğu sevgiyle onun beyaz bir kadın olması arasında bir uzlaşma yolu bulmaya çalışmaktadır. Roman, hem sömürgeleştirilen hem de sömüren üzerindeki yıkıcı etkileriyle kolonyalizme yönelik güçlü bir eleştiridir. Adaletli ve eşitlikçi bir toplum inşa etmenin zorluklarını ve kolonyalizmin mirasını anlamak isteyen herkes için okunması gereken bir eserdir. Roman, kimlik ve baskı temalarını karmaşık ve sıklıkla çelişkili bir ilişki içinde keşfeder. Yazar bu temaları bir araya getirerek, kolonyalizmin ikiyüzlülüğünü ortaya çıkarır ve yerli halk üzerindeki baskıcı sistemin altında yatan gerçekleri açığa çıkarır.

Yöntem

Bu açıklamalar çerçevesinde, bu makale, romanın içindeki kimlik ve ırkçılık temalarını inceleyerek, sömüren ve sömürülen üzerindeki kolonyalizmin psikolojik, sosyal ve kültürel etkilerini postkolonyal bir bakış açısıyla analiz etmektedir. Önemli karakterlerin ve etkileşimlerinin bir analizi aracılığıyla, makale, güç dinamiklerinin karmaşık ağını çözmeyi ve altında yatan kolonyal ikiyüzlülüğü ortaya çıkarmayı amaçlamaktadır.

Bulgular

Pramoedya Ananta Toer'in *This Earth of Mankind* adlı romanı sömürgeci ikiyüzlülük, kimlik, güç dinamikleri ve amansız özgürlük arayışına dair derin bir keşif sunuyor. Düşündürücü anlatımı ve incelikli karakterizasyonu ile roman, okuyucuları sömürgeci deneyimlerin karmaşıklığı üzerine düşünmeye davet ediyor ve bizi baskı yapılarına aktif bir şekilde meydan okumaya ve onları ortadan kaldırmaya yönlendiriyor. Bu etkileyici romandan çıkarılacak derslerle, çağdaş dünyamızda adalet, eşitlik ve sömürgeci ikiyüzlülüğün ortadan kaldırılması için süregelen mücadeleye katkıda bulunabiliriz.

Tartışma ve Sonuç

Sömürgeci ikiyüzlülükle başa çıkabilmek için, eleştirel öz-düşünümde bulunmak ve haksızlık ve baskıyı sürdüren güç ve ayrıcalık sistemlerini ortadan kaldırmak şarttır. Sömürgeciliğin tarihsel ve süregelen mirası hakkında kendini eğitmek, klişelere ve önyargılara meydan okumak ve sömürgecilikten kurtulma çabalarını desteklemek, sömürgeci ikiyüzlülükle mücadelede çok önemli adımlardır. Kapsayıcılığın teşvik edilmesi, farklı bakış açılarının kucaklanması ve marjinalleştirilmiş seslerin yükseltilmesi hiyerarşilerin ortadan kaldırılmasına ve daha eşitlikçi toplumların yaratılmasına katkıda bulunabilir. *This Earth of Mankind*, sömürgeciliğin bireyler ve toplumlar üzerindeki kalıcı etkisine dair etkileyici bir hatırlatma işlevi görerek bizi geçmişin adaletsizlikleriyle yüzleşmeye ve daha adil ve kapsayıcı bir gelecek için çalışmaya çağırıyor.

Sonuç olarak, Pramoedya Ananta Toer'in *This Earth of Mankind* kitabı sömürgeci ikiyüzlülük, kimlik, güç dinamikleri ve bitmek bilmeyen özgürlük arayışı üzerine derin bir keşif sunuyor. Düşündürücü anlatımı ve incelikli karakterizasyonu ile roman, okuyucuları sömürgeci etkileşimlerin karmaşıklığı üzerine düşünmeye davet ediyor ve bizi baskı yapılarına aktif bir şekilde meydan okumaya ve onları ortadan kaldırmaya yönlendiriyor. Bu güçlü eserden çıkarılan dersleri kabul ederek, çağdaş dünyamızda adalet, eşitlik ve sömürgeci ikiyüzlülüğün ortadan kaldırılması için süregelen mücadeleye katkıda bulunabiliriz.

